


| | | | | |
|--|--|--------------------------------|--|--------------------|
|  <p>environmental affairs Department: Environmental Affairs REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA</p> | Reference: | | | |
| | Circulation: | Aliwal Shoal MPA Forum 2014 | Compiled by: Tenjiwe Selani & Babalwa Stemela | DEA:OC Secretariat |
| Document Type: | Draft Meeting Minutes | | | |
| Title: | ALIWAL SHOAL MPA FORUM 2014 – DEA: OCEANS & COAST & WWF Time : 10h30 – 20h00 Venue : Rocky Bay Resort in KZN Date : 11 – 14 February 2014 Facilitated by: Mr John Duncan (WWF) | | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|---------------------------------|--|-------------|----------|
| 1. | Opening and welcome | – The Chairperson open and welcome all members present to the meeting. A special welcome to Dr Monde Mayekiso (DDG), Mr Andre Share (CD in ICM) management of DEA: OC; Mr Mkefe also acknowledged the presence of the COO of Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife Dr Bandile. Mkhize. | None | |
| 1.2 | Registration | The attendance register was signed by everyone present | None | |
| 1.3 | House Rules: John Duncan | The house rules were highlighted. | None | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|---|---|--------|----------|
| 1.4 | Apologies | <p>The following apologies were acknowledged:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Dr Ane Oosthuizen (SANParks) – Dr Kerry Sink (SANBI) – Shalien De Silver (DAFF) – Bruce Mann (ORI) – Herry Peters – Herman Oosthuizen (DEA: OC) – Dr Toffiek Samaai (DEA:OC) – Mzwabantu Kostauli (ECPTA) – Lindelani Mudau (DEA:OC) – Prideel Majiedt (SANBI) | | |
| 1.5 | Acceptance of 2012 minutes and matters arising | <p>The minutes were checked and adopted with few minor changes suggested by Mr Mbulelo Dopholo of SANParks, herein under inputs.</p> <p><u>Shore-based recreational angling results summary</u></p> <p>ANP</p> <p>Monitoring effort is stable ~ +70 surveys / month – consistency in patterns observed</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|------|--|--------|----------|
| | | <p>SE and SW winds seem to be ideal for angling, but must still has to disentangle the holiday effect</p> <p>Catch composition is diverse, but dominated by kabeljou, sand shark and galjoen (all galjoen was caught within season)</p> <p>Most of the white steenbras caught is undersized – sustainability concern (chronic recruitment failure)</p> <p>The main reason for fishing is to relax and have fun; and the occupation of the anglers is diverse</p> <p>The average expenditure was higher over weekends, and the composition of anglers was dominated by locals in winter with no nationals. In summer the proportion of locals was substantially reduced and that of nationals increased</p> <p>WCNP</p> <p>Monitoring effort was not stable, and start monitoring times not spread out evenly – hence inconsistency in observed patterns</p> <p>NE and SE winds seem to be ideal for angling, but must still has to disentangle the holiday effect</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|------|--|--------|----------|
| | | <p>Catch composition was not diverse, typical of the upwelling region systems</p> <p>Most of the fish caught was within size limit, except for steentjie, which doesn't have a set size limit – sustainability concern for steentjie (chronic recruitment failure)</p> <p>CPUE was highest during Spring and Summers seasons associated with Holiday visitors</p> <p>Question and answers</p> <p>Answer:</p> <p>The results reflect what empirical evidence shows, and one cannot manipulate data to mimic results of the previous studies as the environment and fisher behaviour is not static. Thus it is inconceivable that one would expect the exact results observed more than a decade or two ago to be reproduced.</p> <p>Answer:</p> <p>The staff is well trained and three of the staff are in</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|---|--|-------------|----------|
| | | <p>fact anglers themselves so know the fish very well. In addition, I always do re-training session every three to six months depending on staff turnover. The issue about seeing through lies is a difficult one, as we only work with fish caught by the time of interview.</p> | | |
| 2 | Overview of the meeting | <p>Mr Xola Mkefe from Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA), presented an overview of the meeting and the purpose of the meeting from the department perspective. Mr Mkefe highlighted that it is a casual meeting, an informative meeting, a learning exercise where conservation officials come together and share lessons learnt.</p> | None | |
| 3 | EKZNW Welcome: Dr Bandile Mkhize | <p>Dr Mkhize welcomed and acknowledged the presence of different agencies. He welcomed staff from the municipalities, his colleagues from EKZN Wildlife and law enforcement agencies. In his welcoming speech, he talked about the importance of the ocean in general.</p> | None | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|---|---|--------|----------|
| 3.1 | DEA: Welcome and Opening Address: DEA DDG: Oceans & Coasts | <p>Dr Mayekiso gave a picture around MPA management. He highlighted things that were done around MPAs in the last 20 years. He mentioned that in 1982 members of the United Nations signed the Law of Sea (UNCLOS). He also mentioned that it took 12 years or more to negotiate this law.</p> <p>Dr Mayekiso highlighted that the Law of the Sea was to give control of zones of the sea and the coastal state. He mentioned that another important event in our history was the 1992 agenda 21 and again the agenda 21 covered a number of coastal environmental sustainable issues. He said what was important about it was to integrate the management of the coast and management of the oceans.</p> <p>Dr Mayekiso also referred to marine legislation, mentioning that in 1997 a marine fisheries white paper was written followed by the 1998 MLRA section 43 of which it allows for MPAs to be</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|------|---|--------|----------|
| | | <p>established. He said the department is excited when the white paper was approved for ocean governance and they never managed oceans in an integrated way, various departments were doing their own thing.</p> <p>Dr Mayekiso also mentioned that department worked on economic perspective of oceans, in doing the research and department discovered that oceans contribute to the GDP of South Africa. He highlighted that in 2002 in WSSD, government took a decision that they would establish high seas MPAs and they gave themselves a deadline of 2010 but the year came and there were no high SEAS MPAs.</p> <p>Dr Mayekiso lastly mentioned that in 2012 the USA and New Zealand proposed an MPA in Ross Sea Region. Frans, EU and Australia proposed one in East Antarctica; No agreement was reached so far.</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|--|--|-------------|----------|
| 3.2 | Questions and Comments | <p><i>Q – What are the intentions of the department about high seas MPAs going forward?</i></p> <p><i>A – Dr Mayekiso response was that the department view was that they should have high seas MPAs because there is biodiversity in areas that have not been discovered. He said a lot has been destroyed so they thought it was important to have high seas MPAs. Dr Mayekiso also said the previous government did not enforce but they had something on paper but they never enforced. He lastly mentioned that 1994 government vigorously applied law, which is why people are sceptical of this current government that is oppressing people.</i></p> | | |
| 4. | Integrated Coastal Management: The Big Picture: DEA CD: ICM | Mr Share presentation was well received. Andre's presentation focused on Integrated Coastal Management. | None | |
| 4.1 | Questions and Comments | <i>C – Sometimes management plans are ignored,</i> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|------|--|--------|----------|
| | | <p><i>and they are critical because they guide us on how to manage the MPAs and aligning our management with the terrestrial management. There is few management plans, and most of the management plans are those that are linked to Provincial and National Parks MPAs. The one they have they need to be reviewed every 5 years.</i></p> <p><i>Q – What is the department going to do in focusing on measuring the effectiveness of MPAs? Current use outside MPAs, is DEA looking at that?</i></p> <p><i>Ä – DEA is looking at updating the current METT, incorporating MPAs.</i></p> <p><i>Q – What is the value of MPAs or benefits of MPAs?</i></p> <p><i>C – Some of the MPAs need to be reviewed.</i></p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|---------------|---|--|----------|
| 4.2 | Mr Xola Mkefe | <p><i>C – Synergising on MPAs, what they do in MPAs as well as what they do in fisheries.</i></p> <p><i>Q – What are the plans for the department to ensure municipal by inn? Plans for conflict resolution in MPAs.</i></p> <p>Mr Mkefe replied to some of the questions and comments. He mentioned that DAFF has a Small Scales Fisheries Policy, which some people think may affect our MPAs. Mr Mkefe said DEA has an MOU between DAFF and DEA on how they work and even on legislation.</p> <p>Mr Mkefe said regarding MPA awareness, they have to make sure that the communities are taken on board, they encourage each other and every agency that manages MPAs on DEAs behalf to form an MPA forum or management committees.</p> | <p>To synergise the work of MPAs</p> <p>To re-look the park forums and make sure that every voice from the community is represented.</p> | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|------|--|--------|----------|
| | | <p>Mr Mkefe said when they talk about benefits they should be able to identify those benefits quantify them and know that they are realistic and that at the same time they do not overturn the ends of our conservation earnings. Mr Mkefe continued to say they give out permits for interacting with protected species but if the permits are not for that purpose its free for all so he said he is seeing it as a gap and this is what they need to address as management to what is happening outside protected areas.</p> <p>Mr Mkefe further said regarding plans for municipalities, municipalities are the implementers on the ground so they need to know what kind of plans they have. He continued to say DEA at Head Office have Local government support staff, which still needs to be directed towards Oceans and Coast work.</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|---|--|---|---|
| 4.3 | Mr Andre Share | Mr Share answered some of the comments raised. He said there are structures like MINTECH and there is presentation from province as well as SALGA. Mr Share said in all the issues raised on conflict resolution it all depends on engagement of stakeholders. | They will start on how they will engage different stakeholders and there might be no resolution but compromises. They need paradigm shift in the terminology that they use in terms of preserving. | |
| 4.4 | Dr Monde Mayekiso | Dr Mayekiso also replied to one of the questions raised. He said they fail in communicating with people who do not understand the coastal management issues. He said department do not communicate things to the communities. | They should talk to the municipalities to engage communities. | |
| 5. | Update on Coastal Biodiversity Conservation: Mr Xola Mkefe / Mr Siyabonga Dlulisa (DEA) Namaqua MPA process updates: Siyabonga Dlulisa Brief summary of Dwesa-Cwebe MPA re-zoning: Siyabonga Dlulisa | Mr Xola Mkefe presentation covered MPA expansion and directorate achievements. Mr Dlulisa gave an update on Dwesa-Cwebe MPA re-zonation progress. He said department appointed a social study service provider with ECPTA. The | The community will provide information to the | The department target is the 10th |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|------------------------|--|--|--------------------------|
| 5.1 | Questions and Comments | <p>Service Provider has been introduced to the community. He also presented progress on the Namaqualand proposed MPA.</p> <p>Q – Robberg MPA was not featured on the presentation, was it dropped?</p> <p>A – Mr Mkefe answered that it has not been dropped; he wanted to see if there is progress because presentation he made will go to the minister so he said he wants to present something that he will be sure that it will be done.</p> <p>C – DMR should be invited to the forum in order to have proper discussions on coastal mining issues.</p> <p>A – It has been raised to working group 8 (WG8) and department will take it seriously and make</p> | <p>social study service provider.</p> | <p>April 2014</p> |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|----------------------|--|--------|----------|
| 5.2 | Mr Siyabonga Dlulisa | <p><i>sure that department put DMR in the program so that they are invited to attend the next MPA forum.</i></p> <p><i>C – Follow up on the issue of Namaqua. The Addo expansion, the experiments that are done there.</i></p> <p><i>C – Issue of long-term security and acceptance as a priority and put quantifiable measures in place that must be KPAs and on the priorities.</i></p> <p>Mr Dlulisa answered one of the comments, he said department have an MOU with DAFF and our program has to link with DAFF. On the provincial side, he is representing DEA in the Northern Cape Provincial Coastal Committee and gives updates to the NCPCC.</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|--|--|---|----------|
| 6. | DEA Coastal Conservation Strategies: Mr Lindelani Modau (DEA), Represented by Potlako Khati | <p>Mr Khati presentation focused on the background of integrated coastal management, why the coast is so important. Mr Khati also explained what department is doing as coastal conservation strategies and how they are supporting MPAs.</p> <p>He also highlighted the legislations and the framework department using in development of the NCMP, coastal planning, data management dissemination and GIS for good sound planning.</p> | | |
| 7. | Pollution Management Update: Feroza Albertus (DEA) | <p>Ms Albertus presented a background of the work they are doing as a directorate. Ms Albertus said their work is focused on establishing management measures and frameworks to control major sources of marine pollution which are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Land-based sources - Maritime oil pollution - Disposal of waste and other matter at sea and - Other offshore sources (ships, installations, exploration) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Stakeholders debriefing session to be held on the 19th February 2014 - Updating of Oil Spill Contingency Plan for Knysna region in 2014 - Dedicated post for oil spill response training and exercise implementation to be | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|------------------------|---|--|----------|
| 7.1 | Questions and Comments | <p>Ms Albertus continued to say Pollution Management are guided by the following legislations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RSA Constitution - National Environmental Management Act 1998 - Integrated Coastal Management Act 2008 - South African Maritime Safety Authority Act 1998 <p>Challenges</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Kiani Satu: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Incident occurred over long weekend - No updated plan for region - Roles and responsibilities unclear • MV Smart: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Occurred when clean-up for Kiani Satu oil spill was commencing. <p><i>Q – A lot of land based pollution, results from municipal incompetency causing sewage waste. What is going on?</i></p> | <p>filled in new financial year</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Support from new Coastal Research Directorate in guiding measures for monitoring of Oil Spill Impact and recovery of affected environment. | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|--|--|--------|----------|
| 8. | 2013 State of MPAs Report: John Duncan / Karen Tunley | <p>Karen Tunley presented State of the MPA report.</p> <p>Mr Duncan said the report is not finalised, it is still a draft format and there is a bit of work to be done before it can be finalised. Mr Duncan gave initial findings of what has changed since 2009 report and 2013 report.</p> | | |
| 8.1 | Questions and Comments | <p><i>Q – How do DEA plan to implement the institutional arrangement to improve things on the ground?</i></p> <p><i>A – The purpose of the reports is to understand where particular management challenges are and finding approaches or ways around the challenges, because everyone is aware of the limited resources.</i></p> | | |
| 8.2 | Siyabonga Dlulisa | Mr Dlulisa answered some comments and questions. | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|-------------------------|---|---|----------|
| 8.3 | Mr Andre Share comments | <p><i>A – They are relying to DEA partners and making sure that the MOU that the department has with DAFF is working as well as the WG8 and they are working with provincial departments and working with another branch EP / NRM to make sure that the department has eyes and ears on the ground. The department has officials working in all districts municipalities dealing with environmental issues. At the municipal level, they make sure that the communities are involved in the management of the MPA through MPA forums.</i></p> <p>Mr Share made comments.</p> <p><i>C – Looking from a budget perspective the amounts that the department is disbursing to the agencies to manage MPAs on behalf of the department is millions. Mr Share wanted to know what are the agencies doing, where are the gaps? Mr Share said it is important to know</i></p> | Mr Share to look at budget related matters. | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|---|---|--------|----------|
| | | <i>exactly how the budget is spent because as DEA they account for budget.</i> | | |
| 9. | Update on MPA research priorities for 2014: Dr Alan Boyd (DEA) | <p>Dr Boyd presentation focused on research priorities. Dr Boyd mentioned that MPAs are the key focus area for DEA. He mentioned that current MPAs with biodiversity issues are being prioritised like TMNP, Pondoland, De-Hoop, Robberg, Aliwal Shoal and Isimangaliso.</p> <p>Dr Boyd talked about the MPA research where Prince Edward Island MPA will be covered by the April – May cruise of the SA Agulhas Research Vessel. Dr Boyd talked about climate change at Marion Island. He also explained the research for MPA expansion, the key stakeholders involved, and what they are all doing.</p> | | |
| 9.1 | Questions and Comments | <i>Q & C – Making research more inclusive. Who is involved off the ground and on the ground?</i> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|--------------|---|--------|----------|
| 9.2 | Dr Alan Boyd | <p><i>Q – Can you determine climate change?</i></p> <p><i>Q – Who determines the processes / priorities?</i></p> <p><i>Q – Is there a framework / strategy of research within the MPA? Will it have any link to DST or NRM? Interdisciplinary research is quite essential.</i></p> <p><i>Q – What benefit in terms of our resources, in primary research area?</i></p> <p><i>A – There are two processes of determining the priorities. One is the actual legislative things where you have to provide advice for non-consumptive resource use or protection of biodiversity management plan. Identify mandate in various legislation, look at the health in terms of water quality. The climate change caused by carbon dioxide has a profound impact on</i></p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|---|--|-------------------------|----------|
| 9.3 | Mr Andre Share | <p><i>ecosystem.</i></p> <p><i>A – DSC together with NRM was involved in developing southern oceans in Antarctica. Consultation with various stakeholders and they are involved as the department with DSC. Looking at discovery of noble compounds.</i></p> | | |
| 10. | SANParks: Andre Riley | <p>Andre's presentation focused on the management summary, management successes, key challenges, park expansion plan and 2014/15 priorities.</p> <p><i>C – Planning process has been ongoing for about 3 or 4 years and now it is the time to bring local communities on board fully effective right from the start.</i></p> | | |
| 10.1 | Questions and Comments | | | |
| 11. | EKZN Wildlife: Londiwe Mbuyisi / Tamsyn Livingstone | <p>Ms Mbuyisi presented challenges and achievement in the Aliwal Shoal and Trafalgar MPA.</p> <p><i>C – The report is incomplete because its only reflects the bad side of illegal poachers and</i></p> | Introduce environmental | |
| 11.1 | Questions and Comments | | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|------------|---|---|----------|
| 11.2 | Xola Mkefe | <p><i>fishing illegally.</i></p> <p><i>C – The agencies should report on similar issues. The reports should be consistent. There are different views of knowing what success is and what not success is. There should be systems in place that will prevent the illegal activities around MPAs. The reports are not talking to each other.</i></p> <p><i>A – The MPA report is for the forum where it highlights progress for the year. The copies of the quarterly reports will be made available for anyone who would like to see them.</i></p> <p><i>B – It is up to the law enforcement to enforce the legislation and it is up to courts to decide the number of years to sentence a person. It would be beneficial for law enforcement compliance</i></p> | <p>education programmes.</p> <p>Mr Share referred to all the agencies that by the end of the week to give inputs of what works and what is not working and why. He said that would give an idea of how we should change things as the department.</p> | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|--|--|--|----------|
| | | <i>officers to have access to the database of culprits in the court of law.</i> | | |
| 12. | EKZN Wildlife: Tamsyn Livingstone | Ms Livingstone presented a zoning process undertaken by EKZN in the KZN province. The zonation is in line with the KZN SEA plan. The presentation touch base of the Aliwal Shoal MPA expansion. | | |
| 12.1 | Questions and Comments | <p><i>Q – In terms of the input data used, what other information is there?</i></p> <p><i>Q – In terms of zonation, what zonation will be used for the area?</i></p> <p><i>A – It is going to be a no-take zone.</i></p> | | |
| 12.2 | Xola Mkefe | <i>C – The effort that has been put by EKZN Wildlife is being appreciated. It has been a long process.</i> | Once the minister has gazetted it for the public participation, it is the start of the formal process of | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|-------------------------------|---|---|----------|
| | | | engaging the public. | |
| 13. | ECPTA:Vuyani Mapiya | Mr Mapiya presented challenges and achievement of the ECPTA in all ECPTA MPAs. | Mr Dlulisa suggested that Mr Mapiya should have a meeting with DAFF, | |
| 13.1 | Questions and Comments | <p>Q – Does the amount of force that is being used equivalent to the risk that is faced when dealing with issues?</p> <p>A – To carry a firearm you have to be trained. SAPS should be involved because there are no proper investigations when it comes to illegal poachers.</p> | Department of Justice and present the findings to the working group 4 to inform the EMIs that they have a problem of not understanding the sensitivity of FCOs working on MPAs. | |
| 13.2 | Mr Gongqose | Mr Gongqose touched on the Dwesa-Cwebe MPA issue. Mr Gongqose raised his concerns. He gave a history of when the area was closed and when the problem started. Mr Gongqose informed everyone that government never consulted the community | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|------|---|--------|----------|
| | | <p>and they have been fighting the battle for too long.</p> <p>He said the community were arrested without the community knowing that the area was closed and they were not allowed to fish in that area anymore.</p> <p>Mr Gongqose said that led to many problems for example the hotel that used to employ people started losing clients, there were no jobs. They used to fish and sell to the hotel and now that opportunity was closed.</p> <p>Mr Gongqose continued and said as a community leader they decided to stop the illegal fishing because they see movement from government and they are talking to the community to participate in the government processes of zoning Dwesa-Cwebe MPA. Mr Gongqose lastly said they hope that government is not going to delay the process as they did in the past years.</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|-------------------------------------|--|--|----------|
| 14. | Isimangaliso: Mr Sizo Sibiya | Mr Sibiya presented challenges and achievements of Isimangaliso Wetland Park Authority, sighting poaching. | | |
| 14.1 | Questions and Comments | <i>Q – What are the mechanisms to be put in place to prevent those illegal activities?</i> | | |
| 14.2 | Sizo Sibiya | <i>Q – Research related question</i> <i>A – In order for Isimangaliso to be able to move forward they need to understand the working relationship between DEA and Isimangaliso. Look at the agreement which stipulates who supposed to do what.</i> | Research and Management to work together to address matters. | |
| 14.3 | Andre Share | <i>A – Referring to research, there are legislative requirements that give research the mandate that also sets the research agenda as government department to apply research so that it can fit into management decision making and policy development.</i> | To come together for a comprehensive research. | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|--|---|--------|----------|
| 15. | CapeNature: Pierre De Villiers / Alexis | Alexis presentation was a report back on 5 CapeNature MPAs i.e. Robberg, Goukamma, Stillbaai, De Hoop and Betty's Bay. | | |
| 15.1 | Questions and Comments | <p>A brief background of these 5 MPAs was given:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - CapeNature is the managing authority for five MPAs in the Western Cape. - Each is unique with its own set of challenges - CapeNature holds a bi-annual MPA, Islands and Estuaries Forum - Support the Western Cape Provincial government with regards to management issues at the PCC, MCC, PAAC and estuary management forum level <p>Ms Alexis gave a report on the proposed budget for 2013/2014 and the budget received for 2013/2014 and the budget breakdown expenditure.</p> <p>Ms Alexis also gave a brief progress on compliance</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|------|---|---|----------|
| | | <p>and law enforcement, the patrols conducted, the transgressions and lack of FCO cards and EMI certificates which makes law enforcement challenging.</p> <p>She gave an overview of MPA resonation and realignment, which are Goukamma, Robberg and Betty's Bay. She also gave a feedback on management plans</p> <p>The following feedback or report was given:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environmental education and awareness - Staff training - Research and monitoring - MPA highlights and lowlights <p><u>Priorities for 2014 / 2015</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Establish and continue our research and monitoring priorities - Complete MPA resonation and realignment | <p><u>Management plans</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Betty's Bay completed in 2012 - Robberg completed in 2012 - Goukamma to be completed in 2014 / 2015 - De Hoop to be completed in 2014 / 2015 - Stillbaai to be completed in 2017 / 2018 | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|--|--|--------|----------|
| | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Complete Goukamma and De Hoop management plans <p>No questions or comments raised.</p> | | |
| 16. | Nelson Mandela Bay Metro (Sardinia Bay): Alita Kruger | <p>Ms Kruger presentation focused on the following:</p> <p><u>Management Successes</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Are quite successful with waste management, working for the coast initiatives - Abalone confiscations and have started new partnership with Tactical Task Force to help curb the poaching problem - The MPA has become very popular with tourists - On the MPA the average compliance is 90% and 10% enforcement - Have sent all their rangers to Fire Arm training again <p><u>Key Challenges</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Biodiversity: to maintain biodiversity of Sardinia | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|------------------------|--|--------|----------|
| 16.1 | Questions and Comments | <p>Bay.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - User groups: have a huge range of groups using the area and it becomes a challenge when they start interacting and have disagreements - Downsizing of officers from three offices to two is a problem. - Education and awareness programmes are lacking - They need to work with Law enforcement entities outside municipal structure for support. - Having staff on contract (who have been trained on various trainings / courses and end up losing the skills because of lack of job security) - Need to make the Sardinia Bay MPA area a total dive ban zone <p>Q – The income generated from fines, does it go to NMBM?</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|--------------|---|--------|----------|
| 16.2 | Alita Kruger | <p><i>A – The money goes to the Traffic Department.</i></p> <p><i>C – Support the dive ban because it would be a pro-active approach because it prevents resources from being damaged.</i></p> <p><i>C & Q – They needed to pass bi-laws to enforce marine issues. Why they cannot use Marine Living Resources Act (MLRA)? Are the people employed as Fishery Control Officers (FCOs)?</i></p> <p><i>A – No one is employed as an FCO, they rely on DAFF, and it is the department that passes by laws. Department has to assist NMBM as EMI not FCOs.</i></p> <p><i>C – At this point Sardinia Bay has Peace Officers and relies on Municipal bi-laws.</i></p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|-----------------------------|---|--------|----------|
| 17. | City of Cape Town: Jaco Uys | <p>Mr Uys presentation focused on the following:</p> <p><u>Management Successes</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Managed to draft Management Plan for estuaries - Appointed as FCOs - Had their METT Assessment which identified few shortcomings, mainly the management plans - Have managed to keep signage up in the MPA for more than six months which is a big success as people use to take it down all the time - Have 1 staff allocated to the MPA and have been relying on landlord neighbours and DAFF through good relationship for compliance monitoring in and out of the MPA. <p><u>Challenges</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Capacity: will not have any staff after June 2014 due to financial problems - Vehicles: have 2 motorbikes and rely on borrowing vehicles from other reserves - Budget constraints | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|------------------------|---|--------|----------|
| 17.1 | Questions and Comments | <p><u>Priorities</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Finalisation of the management plans - Establishing of Fish Monitoring Programmes - Investigating the possibility of a French Group - Training: EMI Course - Research: 2014 / 2015 Ecosystem Health in Estuary Systems and look at Catchment areas. - Work close with i (Cape Peninsula University of Technology) when they doing research in the MPA <p><i>C – Problem with Gillnetters in the estuary.</i></p> <p><i>A – City of Cape Town is working with Marine Unit, to monitor anglers who are fishing in adjacent to the MPA. City getting law enforcement officials to assist in compliance.</i></p> <p><i>C – Report request on the status, the entire</i></p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|--|---|--------|----------|
| | | <p><i>report does not cover estuaries because most estuaries are on MPAs and DEA has a mandate to develop Estuaries Management Plans (EMPs). MPA Managers who have estuaries in their MPAs need to report on estuaries as well.</i></p> | | |
| 18. | <p>Legislative updates: Advocate Radia Razack</p> | <p>Adv. Razack gave a background of the MLRA, what is NEMPA A about and how is it different from the MLRA, the impact of NEMPA A on the management of MPAs.</p> <p>Adv. Razack gave an overview of the amendments, the legislation after the split of DEAT (MCM) and which functions fall under DEA and which functions falls under DAFF.</p> <p>Adv. Razack also advised that the Bill is coming out soon, and is currently with the Portfolio Committee. The Bill will ensure smooth transition of MPAs from MLRA to NEMPAA. It is best to follow NEMPAA as the minister has full control of NEMPAA as opposed to MLRA. Lastly, Adv. Razack advised that is best to</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|--|--|--------|----------|
| 18.1 | DEA Compliance and Enforcement: Tandiswa Jacobs | <p>get EMI designation rather than FCOs.</p> <p>Ms Jacobs gave a brief background on Compliance and Enforcement Capacity, the current status quo of OC Compliance and Enforcement.</p> <p>She further mentioned that other sections within MLRA would be transferred to NEMBA TOPS. Due to the above pending legislative amendments, it is clear that the compliance & enforcement will have to be undertaken by EMI's, there is a shorter version of the training for EMI designation.</p> <p>Consensus was reached to have Implementing Agents' officials earmarked for FCO Designation trained and designated as Grade 5 EMI's, in line with the legislative mandate of the pending amendments.</p> <p>In total there are 135 officials need to be trained as EMIs (Agencies can conduct/offer their own training in consultation with the EMI Inspectorate for guidance.</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|---|--|--------|----------|
| 18.2 | Questions and Comments | <p><i>C – The course is only offered by DEA National (no other institution offers the course)</i></p> <p><i>C – All the officials already trained as EMIs before the split need to be designated under DEA.</i></p> | | |
| 19.1 | <p>Specialist Monitoring: Mr Ayanda Matoti</p> <p>Questions and Comments</p> | <p>Mr Matoti gave a brief South African history on monitoring; the objectives and the structure of his new Chief Directorate. He explained 3 types of compliance: Compliance Monitoring; Performance Monitoring and those they are focused on Descriptive Monitoring.</p> <p><i>C - DEA specialist-monitoring unit will not only monitor internal legislations but will also</i></p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|--|--|--------|----------|
| | | <p><i>monitor other departments who have environmental related legislations in place i.e. if (Department of Transport, DMR, DAFF etc.)</i></p> | | |
| 20. | <p>EKZN Wildlife compliance experience: George Nair</p> | <p>Mr Nair explained their core functions as monitoring and administration and generates reports indicating their achievements and presented the 2012/2013 report.</p> <p>They monitor Durban and Richards Bay Harbours as well as King Shaka and Richards Bay Airports imports and exports.</p> <p>Inspected 54 long liners (54 local and 71 foreign) and 62 vessels that came to port and further gave a list of their monitoring activities.</p> <p>Have forums consisting of compliance officers, conservationists, SAPS, prosecutors and attorneys who attend to guide and discuss compliance and prosecution matters</p> <p>C - There is a need to figure/find a way that</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|--|--|--------|----------|
| 20.1 | Questions and Comments | <p><i>funds collected by Justice for fines can be paid back to Marine Living Resources Fund.</i></p> <p><i>C - Need to deal with illegal advertising of Boat Based Watching based on argument that they are spotting and not watching.</i></p> | | |
| 21.1 | <p>Ocean Policy Update: Mr Gcobani Popose</p> <p>Questions and Comments</p> | <p>Mr Popose gave a brief background on the objectives of the Oceans Policy, the process of policy development, policy response, and guiding principles on the White Paper on National Environmental Management of the Oceans (NEMO). He presented Strategic Themes and implementation steps of the Oceans Policy.</p> <p>Various agencies were involved in the drafting of the White Paper and consultation was conducted.</p> <p><i>C - At the moment the focus on the governance issues, what can be done going forward rather than what could not be done in the past which is documented on the White Paper</i></p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|---|---|--------|----------|
| | | <p><i>Q - Data Management: would it not be replication of what other data management agencies are doing? The instruction from the Cabinet is to get every sector involved in the ocean environment and not get into the trend that other data managing organisations tend to such as focusing on one particular area that they are busy with and ignore others.</i></p> <p><i>Q - Have there been any success involving other departments (DAFF/DMR)? DMR and DAFF have been part of the process from initial stages up until the stakeholders meeting in Parliament.</i></p> | | |
| 22. | <p>The Human Dimension of MPAs: Serge Raemaerkers</p> | <p>Serge gave a report back on 'Looking at how to integrate human dimensions into MPA Planning Management and Decision Making Project', how the project came about, the objectives and presented drafts developed.</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|--|---|--------|----------|
| 23. | Human Dimensions Guidelines discussion: Merle Sowman (UCT EEU) | <p>Merle indicated that the project has been running for 3 years and one of the ultimate outputs was to come up with the guidelines for integrating human dimensions into planning, management and evaluation.</p> <p>The human dimensions guidelines focuses on the human system, which comprises of the social, economic, cultural, political and the governance dimensions (each of these is unpacked).</p> <p>The 1st part of the guidelines document explains what human dimensions are, why there is a need to think about them and how they can be integrated; the 2nd part has supporting information, key references and recommended readings.</p> | | |
| 23.1 | Questions and Comments | <p><i>C - People like Kerry Sink in Conservation Planning have been involved</i></p> <p><i>Q - Has there been any endorsement from government i.e. DEA and DAFF? There have been a presentation on the overview and</i></p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|--|--|--------|----------|
| | | <p><i>ongoing meetings with DAFF and DEA; and the request was to all key agencies comment on the guidelines</i></p> <p><i>C - We need to move away from the notion of qualitative and quantitative and start to see the links in this ecosystem approach</i></p> <p><i>C - Suggestion is to follow the process through NEMA and get the stakeholders support and it would be better this handled/conducted by an official with social sciences background.</i></p> | | |
| 24. | <p>WWF Small-scale fisheries project: Mkhululi Silandela</p> | <p>The presentation focused on the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Challenges that the small-scale fisheries face - Fisheries improvement concept - Strategies that can work going forward - Project overview of Kleinmond: Fisheries value chain. - Their focus now is on the supply chain challenges and working forward in resolving them. | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|------------------------|--|--------|----------|
| 24.1 | Questions and Comments | <p><i>C - The medium term progress is that fishers who are involved in the project and fishers who were not involved in the project can start talking to each other looking at the social upliftments and social benefits are better, in the longer term the idea behind is to start revitalising and revamping a broader goal of looking at conservation issues.</i></p> <p><i>C - The challenge is the limitation of boundaries when having restrictions to manage outside the reserve boundaries and it becomes DAFFs responsibility.</i></p> <p><i>C - Western Cape human dimensions model tend to dominate, there is a need to recognise human dimensions from KZN and Eastern Cape, which create a different dynamic needing to be understood and articulated. DEA needs to address that, so that areas find solutions best suit those particular areas.</i></p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|---|--|--------|----------|
| 25. | MPA capacity development: Lawrence Sisitka | <p>The presentation focused on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Training for the sustainable management of Marine Protected Areas - Management Training for South African MPAs and Critical Coastal Areas - The areas not covered on the training, commonalities and purposes - Future approaches (SA and Regional) and Global Partnership for professionalising Protected Area Management <p>None</p> | | |
| 25.1 | Questions and Comments | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - People on the grass-roots level want to be part of the decision making in the MPA. | | |
| 25.2 | Declaration: Lindani | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The declaration touched on the following: That the community feels harassed by compliance officers through violence and property damage, the livelihoods of people located adjacent to | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|--|---|--------|----------|
| | | <p>MPAs are negatively impacted. Deliberate exclusion of the small scale fishers from where they historically fished and communities have been excluded in decisions to proclaim MPAs. The community will embark on specific programmes of action to address urgent resolution of conflict in affected areas especially in Dwesa Cwebe MPA. The affected areas present were mentioned as Western Cape Boat-based Langebaan, St. Helena Bay, Richards Bay, Hluleka, Dwesa Cwebe and etc.</p> | | |
| 26. | <p>NATURAL SCIENCE MPA RESEARCH: DR ALAN BOYD</p> | | | |
| 26.1 | <p>Coastal Research: Key Focus Areas: Dr Maya Pfaff</p> | <p>Research provide scientific research and advise other directorates and they monitor estuaries, spatial planning initiative working with SANBI and NMMU</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|--|---|--------|----------|
| 26.2 | Questions and Comments | <p><i>C - Researchers do not inform communities on the research being conducted in their areas and what the findings are, the community needs to be informed of these.</i></p> <p><i>C - Communication is critical and if you want a National Programme that you want everyone to buy into and support then a lead need to be taken to identify the 3/5 key priorities that need to be implemented along the coast</i></p> <p><i>C - The managing agencies are responsible to communicate with communities to update on any developments on research taking place in the MPA.</i></p> | | |
| 27. | Comparative MPA assessment (Betty's Bay, Robberg, and emphasising Table Mountain): Imtiyaz Malick | <p>Imtiyaz covered some of the reasons and some of the aims that they are trying to achieve. He explained biodiversity research and their upcoming projects and shared the camera technology they are currently using in their research.</p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|---|--|--------|----------|
| 28.1 | <p>BRUV Research in MPAs: Lauren De Vos (UCT / SAEON)</p> <p>Questions and Comments</p> | <p>They are using under water cameras that are deployed on the sea floor to remotely survey fish in the region without extractive sampling.</p> <p>Picked up 3 questions relating to MPAs.</p> <p><i>C - Some of the work showed, addresses some of the questions that have come up previously about the research priorities and so much work could be done along the coastline.</i></p> <p><i>C - Survey has been completed and awaiting draft findings, the paper is coming up in the next 6 months with details on how the sampling was done.</i></p> <p><i>C - No significant difference in Falsebay – 3 papers coming up</i></p> <p><i>C - Research has become a monitoring programme accepted in the country and there is a need to get it out there through workshops and presentations.</i></p> <p><i>Q - Research questions to be discussed next/</i></p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|------|--|--------|----------|
| | | <p>areas not covered:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <i>What is the value of the MPA in terms of seeding out of the MPA?</i> - <i>Comparison in and out of the MPA – abundance in diversity; movement and how it relates to zoning</i> - <i>Social benefits/ opportunities of the MPAs</i> - <i>Alien species; heavy metals and the efficacy of housing for penguins</i> - <i>The relevancy of the criteria used to establish MPAs, are they still relevant?</i> - <i>Mining effects on MPAs</i> - <i>Importance of MPA to its use (social study on how people perceive MPAs)</i> - <i>Costs of managing an MPA using current models – cost benefits of an MPA</i> - <i>Rolling up the work that has been carried out in KZN</i> - <i>Benefits of tourism in MPAs</i> - <i>Capacity of sustaining an MPA</i> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|--|---|--------|----------|
| 28.2 | Management effectiveness and tracking tool system: Mr Caiphus Khumalo | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <i>How to develop a model/best practice of co-management</i> - <i>Impact of swimming with seals (the impact on seals and human) –there is a project in place to study the impact on seals</i> <p>Mr Khimalo gave some perspective from the terrestrial system on how METT is being dealt with and integrates the tool to be able to coordinate the reporting to the Conventional Biological Diversity. He covered the METT System results for 2010 and that the National average METT scores were under 50% on the areas of focus. He gave an overview of the management authorities METT scores and some have reached 82% and some with budget challenges scored way below, the average target is 67%.</p> <p><i>Q - Is there a standard guideline on how questions are interpreted to ensure questions are interpreted the same? In a process of</i></p> | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|---|--|--------|----------|
| 28.3 | Questions and Comments | <p><i>appointing a service to sit and re-workshop, the whole METT aiming to have a more refined METT.</i></p> <p><i>C - Need to have a formal guideline on evaluation as people do not have same standards and therefore would score themselves differently.</i></p> <p><i>C - Not comparing management authorities for various reasons such as issues of subjectivity and etc.</i></p> <p><i>C - Need to integrate the marine and terrestrial</i></p> | | |
| 29. | Fish for Life Project: Eleanor Yeld-Hutchings (WWF) | <p>Eleanor briefly introduced the project and explained how WWF Marine Programme Structure and Focus and have explained their structure.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Fish for Life aims to engage recreational fishers to improve the knowledge base for managing recreational fisheries, raise awareness about the status of key species and the value of MPAs and improve recreational fishing practices. | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|------|---|--|--------|----------|
| 29.1 | Questions and Comments | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To draw existing initiatives together and develop as a national umbrella programme for new and existing ventures that contributes to the project aims. - To create network of environmental awareness fishers including a core citizen scientists. - Further gave and explained the project outputs as being: new digital fish distribution records; network of environmentally awareness anglers and key network partners. <p><i>Q - What is being done about the measuring of competition catches the data that they provide is based on Kilograms which can be converted but shouldn't they be encouraged to focus on length</i></p> | | |
| 30. | Long-term fish monitoring in the Pondoland MPA for conservation and fisheries benefits: Jade Maggs (ORI) | Jade gave a brief background of the Pondoland MPA and had 38 monitoring field trips and trying to secure funding to continue monitoring for future five years. He explained their research methods; study | | |

| No. | Item | Discussion | Action | Due Date |
|-----|------|---|--------|----------|
| | | <p>sites; research fishing and indicators of how much/many catches in certain areas and further explained underwater visual census; tag recapture.</p> <p>Future research:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Quantify the amount of spill-over to adjacent fished areas - Exploratory sampling beyond the borders of the sample sites - Calculate natural mortality - Comparison of research fishing and BRUV abundance indices - Fish community studies using BRUV | | |